**UNEMPLOYMENT**

Unemployment refers to an economic situation where factors of production are not put to use. In form of labour as a factor of production, unemployment refers to where labour force is able and willing to work at the existing wage rate but cannot find a job.

**CATEGORIES OF UNEMPLOYMENT**

Unemployment is broadly categorized into two;

1. Voluntary unemployment
2. Involuntary unemployment

**VOLUNTARY UNEMPLOYMENT**

This is a form of unemployment where jobs are available but labour force which is able to do work does not take them at the ongoing wage rate.

**OR**

It is a situation in which people who are able are not willing to work at the ongoing wage rates yet employment opportunities exist.

**CAUSES OF VOLUNTARY UNEMPLOYMENT**

* Laziness
* Low wages and other benefits in the available jobs
* The desire by the unemployment to live on past savings
* Preference of leisure to work
* Poor working conditions in the available employment opportunities
* Expectation of better jobs in the future
* Good economic background of the unemployed
* The unemployed being too qualified for the available jobs
* Unfavourable geographical location of the available job
* Low status esteem attached to the available employment opportunities/ jobs being socially unacceptable
* High risks involved in the available jobs
* Preference to live on other peoples’ incomes (hand-outs)
* Early retirement
* Social restrictions
* Social ties

**INVOLUNTARY UNEMPLOYMENT**

Is a situation in which people who are able and willing to work at the ongoing wage rates are unable to find jobs.

**CAUSES OF INVOLUNTARY UNEMPLOYMENT**

* High population growth rate
* Inadequate skills required for particular jobs
* Discrimination in the labour market based on sex, tribe, religion, race, etc.
* Rural urban migration.
* Low levels of industrial growth
* Technological advancement.
* Changes in climatic conditions
* Deficiency of co-operant factors especially capital.
* Ignorance of the available job opportunities/ limited information.
* Physical disabilities.

**COSTS OF INVOLUNTARY UNEMPLOYMENT**

* Increased dependence burden/ high dependence burden
* Low output/ low economic growth rate due to low output
* Low government revenue
* Worsens income disparities
* Low aggregate demand/ small market size
* Leads to brain drain
* Leads to immorality/ crime
* High government expenditure
* Social evils e.g. alcoholism, drug abuse, gambling, etc.
* Underutilization of productive resources hence waste.
* Misery and low levels of living due to low or no incomes
* Creates political unrests/ political tension
* Discourages investment in education
* Increases rural urban migration and its negative consequences
* Decline in the level of acquired skills.

**UNDEREMPLOYMENT**

Underemployment refers to the state of underutilization of economic resources. In case of labour, underemployment refers to the state of underutilization of labour force in form of working for fewer hours than desired.

**FORMS OF UNDEREMPLOYMENT (add notes from econ text book)**

* Labour force working less time than the normal working hours during a given period
* Labour force doing last resort work
* Labour force engaging full time in socially undesirable activity
* Labour force engaging full time in unproductive activity
* Doing work which is far below one’s training/ skills
* Engagement in activity where co-operant factors are inadequate thus resulting into redundancy of labour force at times during production processes.

**CAUSES OF UNDEREMPLOYMENT**

1. **Scarcity of jobs**

Scarcity of jobs forces people to share the available work and therefore do not utilize their full potential

1. **Inadequate supervision of labourers**

Labour which is not closely monitored puts in less effort thereby underutilizing its potential. This is more in the service sector such as education and health.

1. **Political interference**

This is where some people are given jobs on political grounds and not basing on capabilities/ skills. They therefore underutilize their potential.

1. **Preservation for future use**

This is where some people are employed but they are to be used at a later time may be in the department yet to be established.

1. **Political instabilities.**

Insecurity makes people develop fears to work in certain places thereby confining themselves in certain places where they become over flooded hence less productive.

1. **Low wage rates**

Low wages discourage productivity thereby making labour to put in less efforts resulting into less productivity.

**FULL EMPLOYMENT**

It is a situation where all people willing to work can get jobs.

It is a situation where everybody who is capable and willing to work at an acceptable wage is employed.

It is a situation where the number of unfilled vacancies is equal to the number of job seekers.

It is a situation where the unemployment rate in the economy is 3% or less.

It is a situation where there are more job than job seekers.

**NB**

**Unemployment rate =**

**FACTORS LIMITING ATTAINMENT OF FULL EMPOYMENT IN UGANDA**

* Use of inappropriate technology for example capital intensive techniques of production yet the economy is labour surplus.
* Urban unemployment due to rural urban migration.
* High population growth rate in the economy as compared to the rate of job creation.
* Heavy dependence on nature causing seasonal unemployment. This is very common in the agricultural sector.
* Existence of a large subsistence sector that does not absorb a lot of labour plus limited domestic and foreign investors.
* Shortage of co-operant factors.
* Immobility of the factors of production i.e. both occupationally and geographically.
* Poor manpower planning especially where expatriates are preferred plus structural changes in the economy which breed temporal unemployment
* Inappropriate education system that trains more of job seekers rather than job creators.
* Heavy capital outflows which limits investment.
* Limited domestic and foreign markets hence low aggregate demand.
* Trade union restrictions that tend to prevent entry of new employees. This is done to maintain the wages of the already employed people high.
* Discrimination in the labour market based on race, tribe, sex, religion, age, political factors
* Political instabilities
* Etc,

**TYPES OF UNEMPLOYEMNT**

1. **Disguised unemployment**

This is a type of unemployment where labour force is full time and actively involved in production but its marginal productivity is either zero, negligible or negative. I.e. even when withdrawn, the total output remains the same.

**OR**

It is a type of unemployment where the work available is insufficient for the workforce such that the marginal product is zero or negative.

**Causes of disguised unemployment**

* Poor land tenure system/ shortage of land in some parts of the country.
* High population growth rate.
* Ignorance about other existing job opportunities.
* Nepotism, sectarianism, tribalism in some sectors leading to over recruitment of labour/ corruption in the labour market.
* Employer’s desire to retain work force for future use.
* Inadequate supply of capital.
* Inadequate skills by labour.
* Poor and uncoordinated manpower planning thus excess supply of labour in certain fields compared to others.

**Solutions to disguised unemployment**

* Undertaking land reforms/changing the land tenure system
* controlling population growth rate
* providing information about vacant jobs
* fighting corruption in the labour market
* undertaking entrepreneurship development – empowering the public to create their own jobs
* proper manpower planning
* development of infrastructures
* Training and retraining of labour
* Encouraging the development of agriculture
* Encouraging privatization
* Encouraging economic diversification
* Availing firms with affordable capital for investment
* Encouraging management reforms.

1. **Frictional/ transitional/ turnover unemployment**

This is temporary unemployment that occurs in the short run when labour force is switching from one job to another.

**Causes of frictional unemployment**

* Lack of information about the available jobs on the side of the unemployed.
* Lack of information on the side of employers about existence of those unemployed whom they can employ.
* Inability of employers to identify workers with suitable skills.
* long bureaucracy in recruitment
* Lack of necessary skills for a particular job/ lack of complementary skills e.g. computer literacy
* Social ties.
* High transport costs hence geographical immobility of labour
* Poor infrastructures
* Temporary breakdown of machinery
* Temporary shortage of raw materials.
* Over specialization of labour
* Laying off workers involuntarily and permanently due to government policy

**Solutions to frictional unemployment**

* Providing information to workers about the availability of jobs through advertisement of jobs in News papers, radio, etc.
* Providing firms with information about unemployed workers.
* Encouraging labour mobility such that the unemployed can easily move to areas where jobs are by improving transport and communication systems.
* Reducing the unnecessary laying off of workers by the government.
* Training labour in a variety of skills so as to increase occupational mobility of labour

1. **Structural unemployment**

Is one that arises due to changes in the structure of the economy causing a fall in demand and supply of goods and services hence reduced demand for labour force with particular skills.

**Causes of structural unemployment**

* Changes in production techniques e.g. adoption of capital intensive techniques of production which reduce the demand for labour.
* Decline in demand leading to collapse of local firms
* Poor political atmosphere leading to destruction of productive activities.
* Exhaustion of major raw materials especially non-renewable resources.
* Lack of co-operant factors especially capital.
* Labour immobility.
* Total breakdown of the production process
* Changes in fashions or tastes e.g. when tiled houses replace iron roofed houses, the makers of iron sheets become unemployed.
* Changes in the economic structure of the economy.
* Rural urban migration due to imbalance between rural and urban areas.
* High population growth rates.

**Solutions to structural unemployment**

* Encouraging flexibility in production to enable industries to change with changes in tastes and fashions.
* Diversify labour skills and retrain workers where skills are no longer in demand. This enables the workers to cope with the changing structure of the economy.
* Control rural urban migration by making rural areas attractive e.g. by establishing good economic and social infrastructures in rural areas.
* Importation of raw materials.
* Proper manpower planning to forecast future trends of labour demand in the economy.
* Ensuring political stability.

1. **Seasonal unemployment**

Seasonal unemployment is where people are unemployed due to changes in climate or weather conditions especially in agriculture between harvesting and planting.

**OR**

Seasonal unemployment is where people are unemployed due to seasonal variations. These seasonal variations result into low levels of economic activities during recessionary periods which breed unemployment in the economy. It’s common with the agricultural sector where farmers are unemployed between harvesting and planting season as well as during dry seasons.

**Causes of seasonal unemployment**

* Climatic changes especially in the agricultural sector.
* Periodic changes in demand
* Failure to tame nature.
* Specialized skills i.e. labour cannot work in the different economic situations.
* Low levels of diversification in the economy.

**Solutions to seasonal unemployment**

* Diversification of the agricultural sector so that there is employment through the year.
* Setting up a comprehensive industrial programme to provide part time employment.
* Diversification of economic activities. Individuals should be involved in a variety of activities as a way of increasing their employment opportunities
* Training labour force in a variety of skills such that they can be employed in different jobs.
* Irrigation in case of agriculture during the dry season

1. **Casual/ erratic unemployment**

Is one caused by temporary end of demand for labour force with specific skills. It is mainly due to expiry of contracts e.g. building contractors, road contractors.

**Causes of casual unemployment**

* Expiry of contracts
* Undertaking temporary tasks
* Drastic changes in technology
* Variations in population growth rates

1. **Residual unemployment**

This is one where labour force is rendered unemployed due to physical or mental disabilities e.g. blindness, lameness dumbness.

**Causes of residual unemployment**

* Diseases
* Stigma
* Physical and mental disabilities

1. **Technological unemployment**

Is one in which labour force is not engaged in production due to its substitution with machines/ technological advancement/ use of capital intensive techniques of production.

**Cause**

Introduction of new and better methods of production or introduction of machines

**Solutions to technological unemployment**

* Retraining labour/ diversification of skills
* Diversification of the economy
* Promotion of the use of appropriate technology

1. **Hidden unemployment**

Is a type of unemployment where labour force is employed in a low grade occupation as compared to the high skills and qualifications attained e.g. a female university graduate becoming a house girl.

**OR**

Is one where labour force does a job which is not is not in line with his/ her educational training and qualifications e.g. an engineer working as a secondary school mathematics teacher.

1. **Open urban unemployment**

This is where people are actively looking for jobs in urban areas but cannot find them. The major cause of this type of unemployment is rural urban migration.

**Causes of open urban unemployment**

* Limited skills/ poor education system
* Technological development leading to technological unemployment
* Lack of information about employment opportunities.
* Discrimination in the labour market
* Decline in the demand for the products of some firms leading to their closure.
* Retrenchment
* Unfavourable climatic changes/ seasons
* Limited capital
* Switching of jobs leading to frictional unemployment
* Break down of industrial firms
* Exhaustion of raw materials.
* Rural urban migration
* Employment of foreigners
* Unfavourable political climate
* Changes in the structure of the economy
* Immobility of labour.

1. **Deflationary unemployment**

This is a type of unemployment that occurs when the number of people looking for jobs exceeds the number of available jobs. It implies that the economy is not productive enough to offer enough employment opportunities.

1. **Natural unemployment**

This is unemployment experienced under conditions of full employment i.e. when the labour market is in equilibrium (labour supply = labour demand)

1. **Export unemployment**

This is a state which occurs where there is loss of market for the country’s export commodities.

1. **Cyclical/ demand deficient/ Keynesian unemployment**

Is one that occurs due to a deficiency in aggregate/ effective demand for final goods and services especially in times of an economic depression or recession.

**GENERAL CAUSES OF UNEMPLOYMENT**

1. **Poor land tenure system.**

Land tenure system refers to the rights regarding ownership and use of land in an economy. Some people have plenty of land which is underutilized while others do not have land at all and therefore they remain unemployed.

1. **Political instability.**

This discourages production, investments, savings all of which narrow the employment pace. It also dislodges people from their employment and thus makes them unemployed.

1. **Declining demand for goods and services.**

This affects output negatively leading to closure of some firms rendering some people unemployed.

1. **Ignorance of people about the availability of jobs.**

This leads to frictional unemployment.

1. **Shortage of co-operant factors** such as capital, land, foreign exchange which renders some labour force unemployed due to limited investment.
2. **Seasonal changes especially in agriculture.**

The seasonal pattern of work in some sectors renders some people seasonally unemployed. For example in the agricultural sector, farmers are unemployed between harvesting and planting season as well as during unfavourable natural conditions like floods, drought, etc.

1. **Rural urban migration.**

Due to rural urban wage gap and other push and pull factors, most people move from rural areas to urban areas primarily in search for better wage employment opportunities. Since the rate of rural to urban migration is higher than the rate of urban employment creation, many migrants from rural areas become unemployed in urban areas.

1. **Poor man-power planning.**

Man-power planning in Uganda does not ensure training of labour to match their demands and as such, there is surplus in some fields and shortages in certain fields. This causes unemployment in fields with many people.

1. **Rapid population growth rate compared to employment creation.**

A high population growth rate compared to the rate at which jobs are being created results into unemployment and underemployment.

1. **Discrimination in the labour market based on race, sex, tribe, religion age, etc.**

For instance when the manager of any department is of a given tribe, he/ she will prefer offering jobs to only tribe mates. This leaves others unemployed.

1. **Use of inappropriate technology.**

Uganda being a labour surplus economy, the use of capital intensive technology by some industries reduces the demand for labour hence unemployment.

1. **Poor infrastructures.**

This is in form of poor road network, poor communication facilities, etc which lead to low levels of investments hence unemployment.

1. **Poor education system.**

Uganda’s education system is theoretical in nature and thus prepares students for to be job seekers rather than being job creators. The system prepares labour force for white collar jobs which are scarce leaving many school (university) graduates unemployed.

1. **Structural adjustment programmes.**

Programmes like privatization, retrenchment of civil servants and demobilization of soldiers all aimed at reducing the number of government employees as a way of reducing government expenditure lead to short run unemployment.

1. **Mental and physical disabilities.**

Mental and physical incapacitation causes residual unemployment. People with such disabilities may fail to be placed in certain jobs even if they existed. For example a limbless woman cannot be a receptionist or a security guard.

1. **Expiry of contracts.**

This is so common among workers who undertake contracts (temporary tasks). When such tasks are accomplished, the workers are rendered unemployed for example building contractors, law firms among others.

1. **Backward cultures.**

There are cultures that prohibit people from doing certain jobs for example a Muganda woman climbing an electric pole. Some cultures even discourage girl child education claiming that it is wastage of resources. The girls therefore end up with no skills needed for employment.

1. **Excessive use of foreign expatriates at the expense of local labour.**

This is common in foreign funded projects, NGOs and in businesses owned by foreigners. This leads to unemployment of the local labour force.

1. **Poor attitudes of people towards work/ desire for leisure.**

Many people have a poor attitude towards work especially the youth. This is because the available jobs have a low pay/ low status esteem attached to them while others are just lazy and some prefer leisure to work.

**MEASURES TO REDUCE UNEMPLOYMENT**

1. **Control population growth rate.**

This should be done by promoting birth control measures such as use of condoms, contraceptives and others.

1. **Education reforms**

The government should revise the education system to suit man-power requirements of the country. More emphasis should be put on vocational training in order to make graduates job creators and not job seekers.

1. **Develop infrastructures.**

Improvement and development of infrastructures increases information flow and geographical mobility of labour. Mobility of labour enhances employment opportunities.

1. **Further privatization.**

The government should continue to expand the private sector through selling its parastatals as a way of creating efficiency in production hence creating more employment opportunities.

1. **Diversification of the economy.**

The government should diversify the economy in order to reduce dependence on one sector. This can be done by encouraging the growth of a number of sectors like small scale industries, fisheries, tourism, etc. in order to increase the rate of job creation in the economy.

1. **Reform the land tenure system.**

The government should reform the land tenure system to enable the landless to have access and ownership over land. This can be done by introducing a land act which stops the eviction of squatters by land lords.

1. **Liberalization of the economy.**

The government should remove unnecessary restrictions on economic activities to allow private individuals to freely participate in business activities. This helps to create more employment opportunities as many people are involved in trade.

1. **Improve on the political atmosphere.**

The government should ensure political stability through democratic governance and the use of amnesty laws. This helps to create a conducive investment climate for both local and foreign investors hence creating more employment opportunities.

1. **Adoption of appropriate technology.**

Uganda being a labour surplus economy, the government should encourage use of labour intensive techniques of production because they can employ most of the country’s abundant human resources.

1. **Improve investment climate.**

A conducive investment climate attracts both local and foreign investors to undertake productive activities in the country. The government can attract investors by providing investment incentives like tax holidays and tax exemptions.

1. **Widen the market both local and foreign.**

This can be done by joining economic integration. This expands the market for goods and services hence stimulating investment thereby creating more employment opportunities.

1. **Advertise jobs.**

The government should guide job seekers on the availability of jobs by advertising them in mass media. This helps to reduce on frictional unemployment.

1. **Modernize agriculture.**

This can be done through the application of modern techniques of production, use of resistant crops and animals, agricultural research all aimed at increasing production and reducing unemployment.

1. The government should provide **social programmes for people with special needs/ disabilities.**
2. **Export surplus labour to other countries.**

The government can help identify employment opportunities for its citizens in other countries as a way of reducing the number of those without jobs.

1. **Provide affordable credit to individuals.**

This can be achieved through establishing various schemes like poverty eradication programmes, prosperity for all funds which provide cheap funding to enable people invest and create employment opportunities.

1. **Fight corruption and embezzlement of public resources.**

The government should ensure proper accountability and transparency by government officials in allocating funds. This can be done by setting up anti-corruption institutions and strengthening anti-corruption laws. Absence of corruption avails more funds for productive investments.

1. **Rural development and transformation.**

The government should transform rural areas through infrastructural development, rural electrification, health, rural water and sanitation. This increases economic activities and employment opportunities in areas as a way of reducing rural urban migration.

1. **Control inflation.**

The government should control inflation using restrictive fiscal and monetary policies. This encourages investment hence creating more employment opportunities.

**THEORIES OF UNEMPLOYMENT**

There are two basic theories which explain the causes and solutions to unemployment. These are;

* The Keynesian theory of unemployment
* The rural urban migration theory.

**THE KEYNESIAN THEORY OF UNEMPLOYMENT**

The Keynesian theory of unemployment states that (according to J.M Keynes); unemployment arises due to deficiency/ decline in aggregate/ effective demand for final goods and services especially in times of economic depression or recession.

Due to a decline in aggregate demand for final products, firms are forced to reduce their level of output, income levels fall, investment is discouraged and thus less capital and labour are employed.

According to J.M Keynes, the solution to unemployment is to increase aggregate demand in the economy and this can be through;

* Reducing direct taxes in the economy
* Increasing government expenditure.
* Using expansionary monetary policy
* Subsidizing consumers
* Increasing wages
* Increasing employment opportunities.

**SOLUTIONS TO UNEMPLOYMENT ACCORDING TO J.M KEYNES EXPLAINED**

1. **Reducing direct taxes in the economy.**

Reducing direct taxes increases the consumers’ disposable income. This enables consumers to increase the demand for goods and services thus increase in aggregate demand is responded to by increasing investments so as to increase output hence raising the level of employment.

1. **Increasing government expenditure.**

Government can increase expenditure through the provision of social infrastructure. This raises incomes of the people employed in the provision of various infrastructures which in turn leads to increased demand for goods and services. Increased demand for goods and services stimulates production which increases the level of employment of capital and labour.

1. **Using expansionary monetary policy.**

Lower interest rates increase liquidity preference and borrowing thus increasing the level of consumption. This stimulates investment in the economy to respond to the increased demand thus increasing output which calls for increased employment of factors of production.

1. **Subsidizing consumers.**

The provision of goods and services especially education and health at subsidized prices enables consumers re-channel their incomes that were previously spent on such services for the consumption of goods. The purchase of goods that were not previously consumed leads to increased aggregate demand for such goods which calls for increased employment of factors of production.

1. **Increasing wages.**

Increasing wages increases peoples’ purchasing power thus increased demand for goods and service. This facilitates investments leading to creation of employment opportunities.

1. **Increasing employment opportunities.**

This is done through encouraging private investments. The provision of investment incentives like tax holidays, tax rebates etc to potential investors leads to increased investments. This leads to increased incomes, aggregate demand and employment creation.

**ASSUMPTIONS OF KEYNESIAN THEORY OF UNEMPLOYMENT**

* It assumes full employment of labor and other factors of production.
* Assumes a well developed industrialized economy
* Existence of excess capacity in consumer goods industries.
* Assumes a closed economy with a well developed private sector.
* Unemployment is caused by deficiency in aggregate demand for goods and services.
* Assumes a short run situation.
* Assumes a wage economy.

**RELEVANCE/ APPLICABILITY OF THE THEORY IN LDCs (UGANDA)**

**To a minor extent, the Keynesian theory of unemployment is applicable (relevant) to developing countries reasons being;**

1. It is true that at times unemployment in LDCs (Uganda) arises from a fall in aggregate demand both domestic and abroad.
2. LDCs (Uganda) have (has) an element of industrialization as suggested by J.M Keynes in his theory hence the theory may apply in the industrial sector.
3. In the long run as supply of co-operant factors for labour increase, the theory becomes relevant i.e. increasing supply of co-operant factors increases investment and therefore multiplier expands hence more labour and capital become employment. This makes the theory to be applicable in LDCs (Uganda).
4. The investment climate affects employment level and therefore promotion of investment in LDCs (Uganda) will expand employment.
5. Use of expansionary monetary policies to increase the purchasing power in LDCs (Uganda) increases employment levels. This policy is put forward by J.M Keynes thus the theory is applicable in LDCs (Uganda).
6. Measures to stabilize export earnings through IMF compensatory arrangements to ensure stable export markets can reduce unemployment e.g. LDCs (Uganda) are (is) encouraging export promotion so as to increase export earnings, income and aggregate demand thereby creating more employment.

**IRRELEVANCE/ INAPPLICABILITY OF THE KEYNESIAN THEORY OF UNEMPLOYMENT IN LDCs (UGANDA)**

**To a greater extent, the Keynesian theory of unemployment is inapplicable (irrelevant) to developing countries reasons being;**

1. This type of unemployment is mainly concerned with demand deficiency yet unemployment in LDCs (Uganda) basically arises from the supply side due to limited skills.
2. It mainly affects the industrialized economies yet LDCs are mostly agro-based countries/ Uganda is an agro-based economy.
3. The theory is applicable under conditions of full employment which conditions are not found in developing countries (Uganda).
4. As a solution to unemployment, Keynes suggests policies which increase levels of aggregate demand such as increasing government expenditure. However, these policies are likely to cause inflation before they solve unemployment.
5. The theory is based on the assumption of a highly monetized industrial economy yet LDCs (Uganda) have (has) a large subsistence sector.
6. The theory is based on the existence of a big and strong private sector yet in LDCs (Uganda), the private sector is small and weak.
7. In LDCs (Uganda), product, money and factor markets are not as developed and functional as assumed by Lord John Maynard Keynes.
8. Firms in LDCs (Uganda) do not respond quickly and effectively to changes in demand because of structural difficulties.
9. The theory puts emphasis on investment multiplier as a contributor to employment creation yet in LDCs (Uganda), the export multiplier is stronger.
10. Keynes based his theory on a closed economy yet most economies of the world (LDCs/ Uganda inclusive) are open economies.
11. There are high marginal propensities to import in LDCs (Uganda). This reduces the multiplier effect leading to unemployment but this possibility was ignored by Lord John Maynard Keynes.

**ASSIGNMENT**

Explain the circumstances under which the Keynesian theory of unemployment may become more applicable in LDCs.

**SOLUTION**

* When the economies are mainly industrialized
* When the economy is under conditions of full employment.
* When the economies are highly monetized
* When there is existence of a big and strong private sector.
* In case firms can respond quickly to changes in demand hence there should be absence of structural/ supply rigidities.
* If the economy/ economies have a strong investment multiplier.
* When the economy is closed.
* In case of existence of functional product, factor and money markets that are highly used by investors.

**NB**

* Students need to know the assumptions/ limitations of the theory.
* Use **“when, in case, if”** as qualifiers because this is purely a circumstantial question.